

**A. CONVOCAATION:**

1. The Canadice Special Town Board Meeting was held on September 1, 2022 at 7:00 pm at the Canadice Town Hall and Virtually via Zoom.

2. Roll call showed the following-

- Present: Supervisor Christopher Vastola
- Councilman John O’Connor
- Councilman Mark Statt
- Councilman Teryl Gronwall
- Councilwoman Kate Crowley

Others Present: Two (2) guests/residents attended the Special Town Board Meeting in person or virtually.

3. Salute to the Flag.

**B. PRIVILEGE OF THE FLOOR:**

\*Mr. Burch Craig apologized for the error on his previous spreadsheet comparing the two HVAC proposals. No one had an issue with the error and appreciated all the work that took place up to this point. As a result it was realized the cost of the proposals were significantly different. The two proposals we now have are quite similar and we have narrowed down our choices to five different options in order to go forward.

**C. OLD BUSINESS:**

1. HVAC Town Hall Contract Proposals-

Town of Canadice – HVAC – Additional Research completed 8/31/22

\***Option 1** – Stay the course, have the current system serviced, live thru the winter; purchase a light commercial & install next year; we do not have commercial system costs and would have to start over. We have enough information to make choices now and any delay will see costs increase.

\***Option 2** – Purchase a residential system at lowest price via ACES (horizontal well) \$89,390 The contractor is required to provide a warranty to obtain the energy credit. The warranty is documented in the quote as (10yr parts/5yr labor).

Aston warranty upgrade should be considered and is in the cost represented (Base = 18 months parts/5yr labor without upgrade)

Horizontal is possible and would work fine; all discussion has favored vertical. Vertical wells take up less space and require less clean up after. Additional costs (would be towns responsibility and no costs estimate has been shown) would be associated with cleanup regrading and seeding for the horizontal loop option as is also true of vertical but much less.

\***Option 3** – If the decision is to Purchase with vertical well use Martins as lowest cost. \$95,110 I would like to see any contract spell out the scope and limits of potential additional cost. Well casing seems to be the only cost variable we see.

**\*Option 4** – Martins with separate zone for conference room and required electric & wiring. Vertical well proposed. \$100,410

**\*Option 5** – Use a vertical well approach using ACES. \$115,390

When evaluating the 2 furnaces we have found that both are manufactured at the WaterFurnace factory in Fort Wayne, Indiana

(2) 5 Ton Geostar Aston series geothermal water to air units Model # GS161\*064

Aston Advanced lookup 161\*064

SC2500AG1.indd (geostar-geo.com)

(2) 5 Ton Waterfurnace Series 5 # NDV064\*101CTR(L)ODA

WaterFurnace Series 5 # NDV064\*101CTR(L)ODA

SC2500AN.indd (waterfurnace.com)

Both brochures list the same “Aurora and Symphony” controls

*\*Base warranty for Furnace:*

The installers are required to provide the warranty to be eligible for the rebate. ACES provides a commercial 10 year parts/5 year labor warranty (March 30th response email).

Martins states 5 year labor in their quote and parts.

Note these warranties are only on the geothermal furnaces, other parts of the system have their own warranties.

*\*ACES is closer in distance than Martins (may be a factor during winter weather);*

To town hall Martins 30.6 miles and 38 minutes, ACES 17.7 miles and 23 minutes. It would be unusual to get service dispatched immediately, more likely it is worked into a service schedule and service timeliness depends on the problem. With the Symphony option, the installer will be able to monitor for remotely.

Both units are residential units; the contractor is required via the energy rebate to provide the warranty; See warranty concerns above

*\*In conclusion:*

Both ACES and Martins submitted bids initially, both companies responded with new bids as requested. We called the references provided by both companies and did not hear any reasons to think they are not responsible.

ACES and Martins fulfilled their obligations under the bidding process, and both are responsive and responsible. There is no discernable difference in the proposed solution we have no reason to think either one would not perform adequately.

Both are proposing to use Nothnagle for the vertical well work.

\*Councilwoman Crowley went over each option proposed.

\*Mr. Craig provided an updated spreadsheet with the comparisons and went over some of the information.

\*After additional questions and discussion, each Board member chose a preferred option. It was decided by all of the Board that Option 1 and Option 3 would be removed from the choices.

- Councilman O'Connor chose Option five as his preferred choice.
- Supervisor Vastola chose Option five as his preferred choice.
- Councilman Statt chose Option four as his preferred choice.
- Councilman Gronwall chose Option four as his preferred second choice if we go with vertical drilling, liked Option two as his first choice since he likes the horizontal drilling.
- Councilwoman Crowley chose Option four as her preferred choice.

\*Additional discussion took place regarding option 4 and option 5. Superintended Fraim responded to some of the discussion regarding the geothermal equipment. The equipment and companies bidding were both responsible bidders and very capable of handling the job. The difference in cost was the major concern when choosing.

**a. Resolution Number 48 of 2022 – Amended Contractor Approval For HVAC & Hot Water Replacement For The Town Hall**

\*Councilwoman Crowley indicated we should include in the language for option four - a timeline commitment, Aston's commitment for delivery of equipment and the warranty should be specific and in writing between the town and the installer. With the additional warranty length, removal of the old equipment in the furnace room and installing the new hot water tank the cost would be \$106,785 and without the additional warranty \$103,185. Councilman O'Connor suggested we move forward with the resolution approving option four. Supervisor Vastola indicated we still need a vertical well placement map.

Supervisor Vastola motioned, Councilwoman Crowley seconded, and it was unanimously carried to approve the resolution.

APPROVED                 Ayes 5                                 Vastola, O'Connor, Statt, Gronwall, Crowley  
                                       Nays 0

WHEREAS, the Town of Canadice commissioned a committee to study and recommend replacement of the Town Hall heating & cooling system; and,

WHEREAS, New York State has announced several initiatives applicable to new construction, renovations and non-serviceable systems, requiring municipalities to invest in green energy solutions; and,

WHEREAS, the committee released a general Request for Proposal (RFP) that did not receive sufficient response, and then rereleased a 2<sup>nd</sup> RFP that did receive sufficient response; and,

WHEREAS, the committee evaluated using a 10-ton geothermal heating/cooling system, horizontal and/or vertical wells and cognizant that CDC recommendations include increased air turn-over rates and MERV 13 filtering; and,

WHEREAS, the Board has reached consensus that Martin's Electrical LLC will provide best value and positive outcomes overall, and,

WHEREAS, the committee also recognized that the Town Hall could be 100% propane independent if the hot water system was replaced at the same time; and,

WHEREAS, ARPA funding has been made available to towns in New York State to improve facilities used by the public in response to the COVID pandemic; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, that this Board approves awarding the contract to Martin's Electrical LLC in the amount of \$106,785.00, Proposal Number 32255.4, to install a 10-ton geothermal system using vertical wells, replace the hot water tank, remove the water softener, and cap the propane service to the Town Hall.

**D. PRIVILEGE OF THE FLOOR:**

\*Mr. Craig thanked the Board for choosing geothermal.

\*Councilman O'Connor indicated he will not be at the September 12<sup>th</sup> meeting.

**E. ADJOURNMENT:**

Councilman O'Connor motioned, Councilman Gronwall seconded, and it was unanimously carried to adjourn the meeting at 8:35 pm.

APPROVED                      Ayes 5                      Vastola, O'Connor, Statt, Gronwall, Crowley  
    Nays 0

Respectfully submitted, \_\_\_\_\_ Eileen Schaefer, Town Clerk